ORTHOGONAL ARRAY SAMPLING FOR MONTE CARLO RENDERING



Afnan Enayet Wojciech Jarosz

Charlie Kilpatrick Per Christensen Andrew Kensler XAR A N I M A T I O N S T U D I O S

DARTMOUTH
 VISUAL COMPUTING LAB





 $F = \int_{A} \int_{A} \int_{T} \int_{\Omega_{n} \cdots \Omega_{1}} f(x, y, u, v, t, \vec{\omega}_{1}, \dots, \vec{\omega}_{n}) \, \mathrm{d}\vec{\omega}_{1} \cdots \, \mathrm{d}\vec{\omega}_{n} \, \mathrm{d}u \, \mathrm{d}v \, \mathrm{d}x \, \mathrm{d}y$

Rendering = high-dimensional integration



 $F = \int_{[0,1]^d} f(\mathbf{x}) \, \mathrm{d}\mathbf{x}$ **Rendering = high-dimensional integration**





 $F = \int_{[0,1]^d} f(\mathbf{x}) \, \mathrm{d}\mathbf{x}$ **Rendering = high-dimensional integration**







Monte Carlo $F = \int_{[0,1]^d} f(\mathbf{x}) d\mathbf{x} \approx F_N = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N f(\mathbf{x}_i)$ Rendering = high-dimensional integration





Monte Carlo $F = \int_{[0,1]^d} f(\mathbf{x}) d\mathbf{x} \approx F_N = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N f(\mathbf{x}_i)$ Rendering = high-dimensional integration





 $F_N = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N f(\mathbf{x}_i)$





 $F_N = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^N f(\mathbf{x}_i)$







X Big gaps & clumps







X Big gaps & clumps **X** Slow convergence:
Variance = $O(N^{-1})$





Jittered sampling

[Cook 86]





Jittered sampling

[Cook 86]



6

Monte Carlo (16 random samples)



Monte Carlo (16 stratified samples)



Monte Carlo (16 stratified samples)

Provably reduces variance X But only practical in low dimensions (1-2D)





[Sobol 67; Kollig & Keller 02] (0,2) sequence





[Sobol 67; Kollig & Keller 02] (0,2) sequence

10

[Sobol 67; Kollig & Keller 02] (0,2) sequence





[Sobol 67; Kollig & Keller 02] (0,2) sequence





12



[Sobol 67; Kollig & Keller 02] (0,2) sequence







[Sobol 67; Kollig & Keller 02] (0,2) sequence









Stratification-based



Quasi-MC/ low-discrepancy





Stratification-based





Frequency-based/ Quasi-MC/ "blue-noise" **low-discrepancy**









Stratification-based

See recent STAR [SÖA*19]





Frequency-based/ Quasi-MC/ "blue-noise" low-discrepancy









Stratification-based

See recent STAR [SÖA*19] X Don't generalize efficiently beyond 2D





Quasi-MC/ Frequency-based/ "blue-noise" **low-discrepancy**









Stratification-based

See recent STAR [SÖA*19] **X Don't generalize efficiently beyond 2D** High dimensional samples?





Quasi-MC/ Frequency-based/ "blue-noise" **low-discrepancy**









Slide after Gurprit Singh

[Cook 86]







Slide after Gurprit Singh

2D (x_1, y_1) (x_2, y_2) (x_3, y_3) (x_4, y_4)

2D (u_1, v_1) (u_2, v_2) (u_3, v_3) (u_4, v_4)

- •
- •
- •







Slide after Gurprit Singh

[Cook 86]

2D 2D (u_1, v_1) (u_2, v_2) (x_1, y_1) (x_2, y_2) (x_3, y_3) (x_4, y_4) (u_3, v_3) (u_4, v_4) 4D (x_1, y_1, u_3, v_3) (x_2, y_2, u_1, v_1) (x_3, y_3, u_4, v_4) (x_4, y_4, u_2, v_2)

























 \mathcal{U}

 \mathcal{U}

Y



19












Ours: stratifies all 1D and 2D projections

All 2D projections are (correlated) multi-jittered



Y

 ${\mathcal X}$

 \mathcal{U}

VCI Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Import/apply Orthogonal Arrays to rendering

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Import/apply Orthogonal Arrays to rendering

▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

- Classic technique (1930s) from statistics/experimental design

- Import/apply Orthogonal Arrays to rendering
- A precursor to quasi-Monte Carlo

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

- Classic technique (1930s) from statistics/experimental design

- Import/apply Orthogonal Arrays to rendering
- Classic technique (1930s) from statistics/experimental design
- A precursor to quasi-Monte Carlo
- Natively creates stratified, higher-dimensional points

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

- Import/apply Orthogonal Arrays to rendering
- Classic technique (1930s) from statistics/experimental design
- A precursor to quasi-Monte Carlo
- Natively creates stratified, higher-dimensional points
- Show how to make these fast and practical for rendering

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

- Import/apply Orthogonal Arrays to rendering
- Classic technique (1930s) from statistics/experimental design
- A precursor to quasi-Monte Carlo
- Natively creates stratified, higher-dimensional points
- Show how to make these fast and practical for rendering

Provide a sort of Rosetta Stone to this literature

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Background on orthogonal arrays

cons made by Freepik and Roundicons licensed by CC 3.0 BY

cons made by Freepik and Roundicons licensed by CC 3.0 BY

Factors:

d = 4

(amounts) Levels:

Experimental design

cons made by Freepik and Roundicons licensed by CC 3.0 BY

Factors:

d = 4

(amounts) Levels: s = 3

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

s discrete levels $\{0, \dots, s-1\}$ $0 \longrightarrow 0$ $0 \longrightarrow 1$ $0 \longrightarrow 2$

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

1 2

1 2

1

0

2

s discrete levels $\{0, \ldots, s-1\}$ 0 runs: $\begin{array}{c} & & & \\ &$ 0 0 factors 0 0 1 2 ()

▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

3	4	5	6	• • •
1	1	1	2	• • •
0	1	2	0	• • •
1	2	0	2	• • •
2	0	1	1	• • •

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	• • •	80
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	• • •	2
OIS ()	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	• • •	2
	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	• • •	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	• • •	0

▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

X Testing all combinations of factors is expensive: $N = s^d = 81$

- What if we consider at most 2-way interactions?

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	•••	80
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	• • •	2
OIS 0	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	• • •	2
	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	• • •	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	• • •	0

▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

X Testing all combinations of factors is expensive: $N = s^d = 81$

A strength t = 2 OA considers all 2-way interactions

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2	2
Ors	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1	2
	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2	0

▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

A strength t = 2 OA considers all 2-way interactions

Every combination of levels in these t = 2 factors is tested.

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2	2
Sio Sio	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1	2
fact	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2	0

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

A strength t = 2 OA considers all 2-way interactions

Every combination of levels in these t = 2 factors is tested.

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2	2
OIS	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1	2
	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2	0

▼/ € | • Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

 $s^2 = 9$ possible combinations

> {0,0}, $\{0,1\},\$ $\{0,2\},\$ [1,0]1,1} {2,1}, {2,2}

A strength t = 2 OA considers all 2-way interactions

Every combination of levels in these t = 2 factors is tested.

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2	2
OIC	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1	2
Eact	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2	0

And these too.

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

 $s^2 = 9$ possible combinations

> $\{0,0\},\$ $\{0,1\},\$ $\{0,2\},\$ [1,0]1,1} {2,1}, {2,2}

A strength t = 2 OA considers all 2-way interactions

Every combination of levels in these t = 2 factors is tested.

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2	2
	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1	2
fact	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2	0

Yes, these too.

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

 $s^2 = 9$ possible combinations

> $\{0,0\},\$ $\{0,1\},\$ $\{0,2\},\$ [1,0] 1,1{2,1}, {2,2}

A strength t = 2 OA considers all 2-way interactions

Every combination of levels in any t = 2 factors is tested.

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2	2
Ors	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1	2
la ci	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2	0

▼/ € | • Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

 $s^2 = 9$ possible combinations

> $\{0,0\},\$ $\{0,1\},\$ $\{0,2\},\$ [1,0] 1,12,0} {2,1}, {2,2}

A strength t = 2 OA considers all 2-way interactions

Every combination of levels in any t = 2 factors is tested.

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2	2
Ors	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1	2
	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0	1
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2	0

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Now we only need $s^t = 3^2 = 9$ runs (for s = 3 levels at strength t = 2)!

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2
	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1
jac fact	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0
	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

ru	ns:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
	<i>x</i> :	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2
tors	y:	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1
fact	U:	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0
· · · ·	<i>v</i> :	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Orthogonal arrays (graphically)

runs:		0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
factors	<i>x</i> :	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2
	<i>y</i> :	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1
	U:	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0
	7:	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Orthogonal arrays (graphically)

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

ru	ns:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
	х:	0	0	0	1	1	1	2	2
tors	<i>y</i> :	0	1	2	0	1	2	0	1
fact	<i>u</i> :	0	1	2	1	2	0	2	0
	7:	0	1	2	2	0	1	1	2



















This OA encodes nine 4D points,

which project to a regular $\mathbf{3} \times \mathbf{3}$ grid when plotting any pair of dimensions.

Rescale to [0,1) by dividing by s





▼/ 6' |• Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering [Owen 92] OA-based jittered





This OA encodes nine 4D points,

which project to a **jittered 3** × **3** grid when plotting any pair of dimensions.

 \times But not uniform in nD

▼/ 6' |• Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering



Jittered projections









This OA encodes nine 4D points,

which project to a **jittered 3** × **3** grid when plotting any pair of dimensions.

Permute levels in each dimension

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering [Owen 92] OA-based jittered

Jittered projections



- 8







▼/ € | •







Strength t = 1 OAs: - Trivial to construct:

rur	ns:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
S	<i>x</i> :	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
tor	<i>y</i> :	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
fac	U:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
	<i>v</i> :	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15



Strength t = 1 OAs: - Trivial to construct:



VCI Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

X





Strength t = 1 OAs: - Trivial to construct:

rui	ns:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
S	<i>x</i> :	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
tor	<i>y</i> :	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
fac	u:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
	<i>v</i> :	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15

- Stratify all 1D projections

VCI Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

X





Strength t = 1 OAs: - Trivial to construct:

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
<i>x</i> :	12	8	1	14	2	10	0	5	4	11	3	13	2	
joj y:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
u:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	·
	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	

- Stratify all 1D projections
- Permute levels

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





X

permute *x*-levels

+					-	
_						



Strength t = 1 OAs: - Trivial to construct:

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
<i>x</i> :	12	8	1	14	2	10	0	5	4	11	3	13	2	
joj y:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
u:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	·
	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	

- Stratify all 1D projections
- Permute levels

VCI Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering



permute *x*-levels

X



Strength t = 1 OAs: - Trivial to construct:

runs:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
s x:	12	8	1	14	2	10	0	5	4	11	3	13	2	- -
joj y:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	•
n:	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	-
	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	-

- Stratify all 1D projections
- Permute levels
 - Latin hypercube sampling (LHS)



Uniformly distributed in xy

X



What about $t \ge 2$?

- Generalization of LHS

- What about $t \ge 2$?
- Generalization of LHS
- Proofs: for what values of N, s, d, t does an OA exist?

- What about $t \ge 2$?
- Generalization of LHS
- Proofs: for what values of N, s, d, t does an OA exist?
- but little emphasis on constructing them quickly

t, s, d, t does an OA exist? tructing them **quickly**

▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Import/enhance 2 existing, and introduce 1 novel method





Import/enhance 2 existing, and introduce 1 novel method - make them **fast**





Import/enhance 2 existing, and introduce 1 novel method

- make them **fast**
- generate samples and dimensions **on-demand**





- make them **fast**
- generate samples and dimensions **on-demand**
- no need to compute entire array; no precomputation

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Import/enhance 2 existing, and introduce 1 novel method





Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2): - stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]
- $N = s^2$ and d = s+1 where s is any prime



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]
- $N = s^2$ and d = s+1 where s is any prime

Bush [1952] (*t* ≥ 2):



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]
- $N = s^2$ and d = s+1 where s is any prime

Bush [1952] (*t* ≥ 2):

- stratifies all **tD** [Owe92] + 1D projections [Tan93]



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]
- $N = s^2$ and d = s+1 where s is any prime

Bush [1952] (*t* ≥ 2):

- stratifies all **tD** [Owe92] + 1D projections [Tan93]
- $N = s^t$ and d = s where s is any prime



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]
- $N = s^2$ and d = s+1 where s is any prime

Bush [1952] (*t* ≥ 2):

- stratifies all **tD** [Owe92] + 1D projections [Tan93]
- $N = s^t$ and d = s where s is any prime

High dimensional CMJ ($t \ge 2$):



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]
- $N = s^2$ and d = s+1 where s is any prime

Bush [1952] (*t* ≥ 2):

- stratifies all **tD** [Owe92] + 1D projections [Tan93]
- $N = s^t$ and d = s where s is any prime

High dimensional CMJ ($t \ge 2$):

- stratifies all tD + 1D projections + correlated [Ken13]



Bose [1938] (*t* = 2):

- stratifies all 2D projections [Owe92],
- 1D projections [Tan93], and
- correlated offsets [Ken13]
- $N = s^2$ and d = s+1 where s is any prime

Bush [1952] (*t* ≥ 2):

- stratifies all **tD** [Owe92] + 1D projections [Tan93]
- $N = s^t$ and d = s where s is any prime

High dimensional CMJ ($t \ge 2$):

- stratifies all tD + 1D projections + correlated [Ken13]
- s is any positive integer; num samples $N = s^t$ and max dimension d = t


Bose [1938] construction: $A_{i0} = \lfloor i/s \rfloor$ $A_{i1} = i \mod s$ $A_{ij} = A_{i0} + (j-1)A_{i1} \mod s$



```
float boseOA(int i,
                             // sample index
                             // dimension (< s+1)
              int j,
 2
              int s,
                       // number of levels/strata
 3
               int p) { // pseudo-random permutation seed
       int Aij, Aik;
 5
       int Ai0 = i / s;
 6
       int Ai1 = i % s;
 7
       if (j == 0) {
 8
          Aij = Ai0;
 9
          Aik = Ai1;
10
      } else if (j == 1) {
11
12
          Aij = Ai1;
13
          Aik = Ai0;
14
      } else {
15
          int k
                = (j % 2) ? j-1 : j+1;
16
          Aij
                    = (Ai0 + (j-1) * Ai1) % s;
          Aik = (Ai0 + (k-1) * Ai1) % s;
17
18
       }
19
       int stratum
                    = permute(Aij, s, p * j * 0x51633e2d);
       int subStratum = permute(Aik, s, p * j * 0x68bc21eb);
20
       float jitter = randfloat(i, p * j * 0x02e5be93);
21
       return (stratum + (subStratum + jitter) / s) / s;
22
23 }
```

Bose [1938] construction: $A_{i0} = |i/s|$ $A_{i1} = i \mod s$ $A_{ij} = A_{i0} + (j-1)A_{i1} \mod s$





Power spectra validation



correlated multi-jittered offsets



Power spectra validation



 ω_{χ}

correlated multi-jittered offsets

 ω_y

 ω_u

Power spectra validation



Ours: OA sampling with correlated multi-jittered offsets

Details in the paper



 ω_{v}

 ω_u



Which dimensions matter?

2D padding
Map your stratified
dimensions carefully



Y



Which dimensions matter?

2D padding Map your stratified dimensions carefully







7D integrand





Random 121 spp

	Relativ	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop	
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4	





Jittered2D (pad) 121 spp

	Relativ	ve MSE
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4
Jittered2D (pad)	1.036e-3	6.123e-4



CNJ2D (pad) 121 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4
Jittered2D (pad)	1.036e-3	6.123e-4
CMJ2D (pad)	8.721e-4	6.142e-4





(0,2)-seq (pad) 128 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4
Jittered2D (pad)	1.036e-3	6.123e-4
CMJ2D (pad)	8.721e-4	6.142e-4
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	8.299e-4	2.825e-4



Ours 121 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4
Jittered2D (pad)	1.036e-3	6.123e-4
CMJ2D (pad)	8.721e-4	6.142e-4
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	8.299e-4	2.825e-4
Ours	7.864e-4	1.587e-4





Halton 121 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4
Jittered2D (pad)	1.036e-3	6.123e-4
CMJ2D (pad)	8.721e-4	6.142e-4
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	8.299e-4	2.825e-4
Ours	7.864e-4	1.587e-4
Halton	7.819e-4	1.683e-4





Sobol 128 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4
Jittered2D (pad)	1.036e-3	6.123e-4
CMJ2D (pad)	8.721e-4	6.142e-4
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	8.299e-4	2.825e-4
Ours	7.864e-4	1.587e-4
Halton	7.819e-4	1.683e-4
Sobol	6.510e-4	3.493e-4





Ours 121 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	1.481e-3	6.755e-4
Jittered2D (pad)	1.036e-3	6.123e-4
CMJ2D (pad)	8.721e-4	6.142e-4
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	8.299e-4	2.825e-4
Ours	7.864e-4	1.587e-4
Halton	7.819e-4	1.683e-4
Sobol	6.510e-4	3.493e-4





9D integrand



Ours 121 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	3.959e-3	2.857e-2
Jittered2D (pad)	1.669e-3	1.112e-2
CMJ2D (pad)	1.557e-3	1.136e-2
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	1.477e-3	1.075e-2
Ours	1.215e-3	6.099e-3





Halton 128 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	3.959e-3	2.857e-2
Jittered2D (pad)	1.669e-3	1.112e-2
CMJ2D (pad)	1.557e-3	1.136e-2
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	1.477e-3	1.075e-2
Ours	1.215e-3	6.099e-3
Halton	1.408e-3	6.912e-3





Sobol 128 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	3.959e-3	2.857e-2
Jittered2D (pad)	1.669e-3	1.112e-2
CMJ2D (pad)	1.557e-3	1.136e-2
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	1.477e-3	1.075e-2
Ours	1.215e-3	6.099e-3
Halton	1.408e-3	6.912e-3
Sobol	1.117e-3	6.185e-3





Ours 121 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Full image	Crop
Random	3.959e-3	2.857e-2
Jittered2D (pad)	1.669e-3	1.112e-2
CMJ2D (pad)	1.557e-3	1.136e-2
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	1.477e-3	1.075e-2
Ours	1.215e-3	6.099e-3
Halton	1.408e-3	6.912e-3
Sobol	1.117e-3	6.185e-3





43D integrand



Ours 3969 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Fullimage	Crop
Random	8.701e-4	1.503e-3
Jittered2D (pad)	7.385e-4	1.529e-3
CMJ2D (pad)	6.524e-4	9.821e-4
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	7.152e-4	1.457e-3
Ours	6.024e-4	9.123e-4





Sobol 4096 spp

	Relative MSE	
Sampler	Fullimage	Crop
Random	8.701e-4	1.503e-3
Jittered2D (pad)	7.385e-4	1.529e-3
CMJ2D (pad)	6.524e-4	9.821e-4
(0,2)-seq. (pad)	7.152e-4	1.457e-3
Ours	6.024e-4	9.123e-4
Halton	5.773e-4	9.845e-4
Sobol	5.994e-4	8.753e-4





Summary



Summary

OAs with *t* = 2 consistently outperform 2D padding - drop-in replacement for 2D padded point sets!



Summary

- OAs with t = 2 consistently outperform 2D padding
- High-dimensional QMC is sometimes better...
- but structured artifacts

- drop-in replacement for 2D padded point sets!





X Only finite point sets; not progressive



- X Only finite point sets; not progressive

X Strength *t* OAs provide no stratification beyond *tD*



- X Only finite point sets; not progressive
- **X** Strength *t* OAs provide no stratification beyond *tD*

- Asymptotically no better than random when integrand d > t



- X Only finite point sets; not progressive
- **X** Strength *t* OAs provide no stratification beyond *tD*
 - Asymptotically no better than random when integrand d > t
- **Vested orthogonal arrays** [He and Qian 2011, ...]



- X Only finite point sets; not progressive
- **X** Strength *t* OAs provide no stratification beyond *tD* - Asymptotically no better than random when integrand d > t
- Vested orthogonal arrays [He and Qian 2011, ...] Strong orthogonal arrays (SOA) [He and Tang 2013, ...]



- X Only finite point sets; not progressive
- **X** Strength *t* OAs provide no stratification beyond *tD* - Asymptotically no better than random when integrand d > t
- Vested orthogonal arrays [He and Qian 2011, ...] Strong orthogonal arrays (SOA) [He and Tang 2013, ...] - Instead of stratifying t-dimensions, stratify all dimensions $\leq t$


Limitations/Future work

- X Only finite point sets; not progressive
- **X** Strength *t* OAs provide no stratification beyond *tD* - Asymptotically no better than random when integrand d > t
- Vested orthogonal arrays [He and Qian 2011, ...] Strong orthogonal arrays (SOA) [He and Tang 2013, ...] - Instead of stratifying t-dimensions, stratify all dimensions $\leq t$ - (t, m, s)-nets and SOA equivalency



Limitations/Future work

- X Only finite point sets; not progressive
- **X** Strength *t* OAs provide no stratification beyond *tD* - Asymptotically no better than random when integrand d > t
- Vested orthogonal arrays [He and Qian 2011, ...]
- Strong orthogonal arrays (SOA) [He and Tang 2013, ...]
- Instead of stratifying t-dimensions, stratify all dimensions $\leq t$
- (t, m, s)-nets and SOA equivalency
- (t, s)-sequences for progressive OA generation?



Thank you!

dartgo.org/OAS



additional results / code

Backup slides

Independent Random Sampling Spatial domain Fourier domain







Regular Sampling

for (uint i = 0; i < numX; i++)</pre> for (uint j = 0; j < numY; j++) { samples(i,j).x = (i + 0.5)/numX; samples(i,j).y = (j + 0.5)/numY;

}







Regular Sampling

for (uint i = 0; i < numX; i++)</pre> for (uint j = 0; j < numY; j++) samples(i,j).x = (i + 0.5)/numX;samples(i,j).y = (j + 0.5)/numY;

}







Jittered Sampling

for (uint i = 0; i < numX; i++) for (uint j = 0; j < numY; j++) samples(i,j).x = (i + randf())/numX; samples(i,j).y = (j + randf())/numY;

[Cook 86]











Jittered Sampling



[Cook 86]

Independent Random Sampling Spatial domain Fourier domain







[McKay et al. 79] [Shirley 91]



Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering



Image source: Michael Maggs, CC BY-SA 2.5 84











▼/ € |-Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Initialize





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering









Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Shuffle columns





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Shuffle columns







// initialize the diagonal for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)</pre> for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++) samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;

// shuffle each dimension independently for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)</pre> shuffle(samples(d,:));





// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>



Initialize



// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>





// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>





// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering



Shuffle columns



// initialize the diagonal
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++)
 samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;</pre>

// shuffle each dimension independently
for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)
 shuffle(samples(d,:));</pre>

VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering



Shuffle columns



// initialize the diagonal for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)</pre> for (uint i = 0; i < numS; i++) samples(d,i) = (i + randf())/numS;

// shuffle each dimension independently for (uint d = 0; d < numDimensions; d++)</pre> shuffle(samples(d,:));

























Independent Random Sampling Spatial domain Fourier domain






Fourier domain







V C |-Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

[Chiu et al. 94]







VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

Initialize





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

111



VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





VC Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

114



Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering

114

Multi-Jittered Sampling Fourier domain



Independent Random Sampling Spatial domain Fourier domain







Fourier domain





Jittered Sampling



[Cook 86]

Multi-Jittered Sampling Fourier domain



same shuffle for all rows/columns



Spatial domain



Correlated MJ Sampling Fourier domain



[Kensler 13]



(0,2) Sequence [Kollig & Keller 02] Fourier domain

Spatial domain





1 sample in each "elementary interval"

(0,2) sequence Fourier domain

Spatial domain





1 sample in each "elementary interval"

(0,2) sequence [Kollig & Keller 02] Fourier domain

Spatial domain







(0,2) sequence Fourier domain





[Sobol 67] [Kollig & Keller 02] Fourier domain





1 sample in each "elementary interval"

(0,2) sequence Fourier domain

Spatial domain





1 sample in each "elementary interval"

(0,2) Sequence [Kollig & Keller 02] Fourier domain

Spatial domain





Limitations/Future work



Limitations/Future work

Sample count: $N = p^t$ where t is strength, and p is prime


Limitations/Future work

Sample count: $N = p^t$ where t is strength, and p is prime

- Galois/finite fields



High-dimensional QMC (Sobol, Halton)

X Higher dimensions rarely as well-stratified as first two



129

High-dimensional QMC (Sobol, Halton)

- Sobol:



dimension 3

X Higher dimensions rarely as well-stratified as first two

dimension 4



129

High-dimensional Sobol sampler **X** Structured artifacts











2D padding









2D padding Map your stratified dimensions carefully







▼ € . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





If A_{ij} denotes jth factor in ith run (*j*th dimension of *i*th point), then:

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





If A_{ij} denotes jth factor in ith run U (*j*th dimension of *i*th point), then: $X_{ij} = \frac{A_{ij} + 0.5}{s} \in [0, 1)^d$

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering [Owen 92]



If A_{ij} denotes jth factor in ith run (*j*th dimension of *i*th point), then:

$$X_{ij} = \frac{A_{ij} + \xi_{ij}}{s} \in [0, 1)^{c}$$

Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering



If A_{ij} denotes jth factor in ith run (*j*th dimension of *i*th point), then:

$$X_{ij} = \frac{A_{ij} + \xi_{ij}}{s} \in [0, 1)^{c}$$

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering





If A_{ij} denotes jth factor in ith run (*j*th dimension of *i*th point), then:

 $X_{ij} = \frac{\pi_j(A_{ij}) + \xi_{ij}}{s} \in [0, 1)^d$ different pseudo-random permutation of *s* levels for each dimension *j*

▼ 6 |-Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering







If A_{ij} denotes jth factor in ith run (*j*th dimension of *i*th point), then:

 $X_{ij} = \frac{\pi_j(A_{ij}) + \xi_{ij}}{s} \in [0, 1)^d$

▼ 6 . Orthogonal array sampling for Monte Carlo rendering



Jittered sampling





